



EUROPEAN MEDICINES AGENCY
SCIENCE MEDICINES HEALTH

12 July 2011
EMA/HMPC/572845/2009
Committee on Herbal Medicinal Products (HMPC)

List of references supporting the assessment of *Symphytum officinale* L., radix

Draft

The Agency acknowledges that copies of the underlying works used to produce this monograph were provided for research only with exclusion of any commercial purpose.

Abbott PJ: Comfrey: assessing the low-dose health risk. *Med J Aust* 1988; 149: 678-82.

Aftab K, Shaheen F, Mohammad FV, Noorwala M, Ahmad VU: Phyto-pharmacology of saponins from *Symphytum officinale* L. *Adv Exp Med Biol.* 1996; 404: 429-42.

Ahmad VU, Noorwala M, Mohammad FV, Sener B, Gilani AH, Aftab K: Symphytooxide A, a triterpenoid saponin from the roots of *Symphytum officinale*. *Phytochemistry* 1993; 32: 1003-6.

Anderson P, McLean AEM: Comfrey and liver damage. *Hum. Toxicol.* 1989; 9: 68-9.

Andres P, Brenneisen R, Clerc JT: Relating antiphlogistic efficacy of dermatics containing extracts of *Symphytum officinale* to chemical profiles. *Planta Med* 1989; 55: 643-644.

Andres R, Bourquin D, Brenneisen R, Clerc JT: The antiphlogistic efficacy of dermatics containing pyrrolizidine alkaloid-free extracts of *Symphytum officinale*. *Planta Med* 1990; 56: 664.

Aniszewski T: Alkaloids – Secrets of Life. Elsevier, 2007.

Bach N, Thung SN, Schaffner F: Comfrey herb tea-induced hepatic veno-occlusive disease. *Am J Med* 1989; 87: 97-9.

Barceloux DG: Medical Toxicology of Natural Substances – Foods, Fungi, Medicinal Herbs, Plants and Venomous Animals. Wiley, 2008. pp. 449-57.

Barnes J, Anderson LA, Phillipson JD. Herbal Medicines. 3rd Edition. Pharmaceutical Press, London, 2007. pp 188-90.

Behninger C, Abel G, Röder E, Neuberger V, Göggelmann W, Wirkung eines Alkaloidextraktes von *Symphytum officinale* auf menschliche Lymphocytenkulturen. *Planta Med* 1989; 55: 518-22.

Benedek B, Ziegler A, Ottersbach P, Absence of Mutagenic Effects of a Particular *Symphytum officinale* L. Liquid Extract in the Bacterial Reverse Mutation Assay. *Phytother Res* 2010; 24: 466-468.



- BGA, 1992. Veröffentlichung einer Bekanntmachung des Bundesgesundheitsamtes (Stufe II, Pyrrolizidin-Alkaloide – Bescheid vom 05. Juni 1992, Akz: GV7-7251-01-25365/1448).
- Blumenthal M, Busse WR, Goldberg A, Gruenwald J, Hall T, Riggins W, Rister R, Klein S (editors). *The Complete German Commission E Monographs; Therapeutic Guide to Herbal Medicines*; The American Botanical Council, Austin, Texas, 1998. pp. 116.
- Brauchli J, Lüthy J, Zweifel U, Schlatter C. Pyrrolizidine alkaloids from *Symphytum officinale* L. and their percutaneous absorption in rats. *Experientia*. 1982; 38: 1085-7.
- British Herbal Pharmacopoeia 1974. British Herbal Medicine Association, Bornemouth, 1971. *Symphytum* monograph.
- British Herbal Pharmacopoeia 1983. British Herbal Medicine Association, Bornemouth, 1983. *Symphytum* root monograph.
- British Herbal Pharmacopoeia 1996. British Herbal Medicine Association, Bornemouth, 1996. pp. 62-63.
- Bruneton J. Pharmacognosy, Phytochemistry, Medicinal Plants. 2nd Edition. Lavoisier Publishing Inc., Paris, 1999. pp. 839-41.
- Chou MW, Fu PP. Formation of DHP-derived DNA adducts in vivo from dietary supplements and chinese herbal plant extracts containing carcinogenic pyrrolizidine alkaloids. *Toxicol Ind Health*. 2006; 22: 321-7.
- Chrubasik S. Effectiveness of *Symphytum officinale* (comfrey root) extract ointment in painful knee osteoarthritis. *Focus on Alternative and Complementary Therapies* 2007; 12: 177-8.
- Chrubasik S. Comparison of local *Symphytum officinale* L. (comfrey) root extract and diclofenac for sprained ankles. *Focus on Alternative and Complementary Therapies* 2006; 11: 21-2.
- Copple BL, Ganey PE, Roth RA. Liver inflammation during monocrotaline hepatotoxicity. *Toxicology* 2003; 190: 155-169.
- Couet CE, Crews C, Hanley AB. Analysis, separation, and bioassay of pyrrolizidine alkaloids from comfrey (*Symphytum officinale*). *Nat Toxins* 1996b; 4: 163-7.
- Couet CE, Hopley J, Hanley AB. Metabolic activation of pyrrolizidine alkaloids by human, rat and avocado microsomes. *Toxicon* 1996a; 34: 1058-61.
- Coulombe RA. Pyrrolizidine alkaloids in foods. *Adv Food Nutr Res* 2003; 45: 61-99.
- CPMP/EWP/482/99. Points to consider on switching between superiority and non-inferiority. 2002 July 27.
- Culvenor CC, Edgar JA, Jago MV, Qutteridge A, Peterson JE, Smith LW. Hepato- and pneumotoxicity of pyrrolizidine alkaloids and derivatives in relation to molecular structure. *Chem. Biol Interact* 1976; 12: 299-324.
- Cupp MJ. Toxicology And Clinical Pharmacology Of Herbal Products. Humana Press, 2000. pp. 203-214.
- D'Anchise, Bulitta M, Giannetti B. Comfrey extract ointment in comparison to diclofenac gel in the treatment of acute unilateral ankle sprains (distorsions). *Drug Research* 2007; 57: 712-6.
- De Smet PAGM, Keller K, Hänsel R, Chandler RF (Eds.): Adverse Effects of Herbal Drugs. Springer-Verlag, Berlin-Heidelberg, 1992. pp. 194-205, 220-222.
- Dewick PM. Medicinal natural products - A biosynthetic approach. 2nd edition. Wiley, 2002. pp. 305-6. (Medicinal natural products - A biosynthetic approach. 2nd edition - P. M. Dewick, Wiley, 2002).

- EMA. 2008. European Medicines Agency, Committee on Herbal Medicinal Products (HMPC). Guideline on the assessment of genotoxicity of herbal substances/preparations. EMA: London; Doc. Ref. EMEA/HMPC/107079/2007.
- Fattorusso E, Taglialatela-Scafati O (editors). Modern Alkaloids - Structure, Isolation, Synthesis and Biology. Wiley, 2008.
- Furmanowa M, Guzewska J, Beldowska B.: Mutagenic effects of aqueous extracts of *Symphytum officinale* L. and of its alkaloidal fractions. *J Appl Toxicol*. 1983; 3: 127-30.
- Garrett BJ, Cheeke PR, Miranda CL, Goeger DE, Buhler DR.: Consumption of poisonous plants (*Senecio jacobaea*, *Symphytum officinale*, *Pteridium aquilinum*, *Hypericum perforatum*) by rats: chronic toxicity, mineral metabolism, and hepatic drug-metabolizing enzymes. *Toxicol Lett*. 1982; 10: 183-8.
- Giannetti BM, Staiger C, Bulitta M, Predel HG. Efficacy and safety of a Comfrey root extract ointment in the treatment of acute upper or low back pain: results of a double-blind, randomised, placebo-controlled, multi-centre trial. *Br J Sports Med*. 2009 May 21.
- Goldman RS, de Freitas PCD, Oga S. Wound healing and analgesic effect of crude extracts of *Symphytum officinale* in rats. *Fitoterapia* 1985; 56: 323-9.
- Gomes MF, de Oliveira Massoco C, Xavier JG, Bonamin LV. Comfrey (*Symphytum officinale* L.) and Experimental Hepatic Carcinogenesis: A Short-term Carcinogenesis Model Study. 2007; *eCAM*, doi:10.1093/ecam/nem172.
- Gracza L, Koch H, Löffler E. Biochemical-pharmacologic studies of medicinal plants. 1. Isolation of rosmarinic acid from *Symphytum officinale* L. and its anti-inflammatory activity in an in vitro model. *Arch. Pharm. (Weinheim)* 1985; 318: 1090-5.
- Grube B, Grünwald J, Krug L, Staiger C. Efficacy of a comfrey root (*Symphyti offic. radix*) extract ointment in the treatment of patients with painful osteoarthritis of the knee: Results of a double-blind, randomised, bicenter, placebo-controlled trial. *Phytomedicine* 2007; 14: 2-10.
- Guo L, Mei N, Dial S, Fuscoe J, Chen T. Comparison of gene expression profiles altered by comfrey and riddelliine in rat liver. *BMC Bioinformatics*. 2007; 8: Suppl 7: S22.
- Hänsel R, Sticher O. *Pharmakognosie – Phytopharmazie*. Springer, 2004. pp. 915-20, 1138.
- Hiermann A, Writzel M. Antiphlogistic glycopeptide from the roots of *Symphytum officinale*. *Pharmaceutical and Pharmacological Letters* 1998; 8: 154-7.
- Hirono I, Masanobu H, Fujii M, Shin M, Matsubara N, Nakayama M, Furuya T, Hikichi M, Takanashi H, Uchida E, Hosaka S, Ueno I. Induction of hepatic tumors in rats by senkirkine and symphytine. *J Natl Cancer Inst* 1978b; 63: 469-71.
- Hirono I, Mori H, Haga M. Carcinogenic activity of *Symphytum officinale*. *J Natl Cancer Inst* 1978a; 61: 865-9.
- Kaufman PB, Cseke LJ, Warber S, Duke JA, Briellmann HL. Natural Products From Plants. CRC Press, 1999.
- Koll R, Buhr M, Dieter R, Pabst H, Predel HG, Petrowicz O, Giannetti B, Klingenburg S, Staiger C. Efficacy and tolerance of a comfrey root extract (Extr. Rad. *Symphyti*) in the treatment of ankle distortions: results of a multicenter, randomized, placebo-controlled, double-blind study. *Phytomedicine*. 2004; 11: 470-7.
- Koll R, Klingenburg S. Therapeutic characteristance and tolerance of topical comfrey preparations. Results of an observational study of patients. *Fortschr Med Orig*. 2002;120(1):1-9.

- Kumana CR, Ng M, Hsiang JL, Ko Wu, Wu P - C, Todd D. Herbal tea induced hepatic veno - occlusive disease: quantification of toxic alkaloid exposure in adults. *Gut* 1985; 26: 101-4.
- Lafranconi WM, Huxtable RJ. Hepatic metabolism and pulmonary toxicity of monocrotaline using isolated perfused liver and lung. *Biochem Pharmacol* 1984; 33: 2479-84.
- Lenghel V, Radu DL, Chirilă P, Olinescu A. The influence of some vegetable extracts on the in vitro adherence of mouse and human lymphocytes to nylon fibers. *Roum Arch Microbiol Immunol* 1995; 54: 15-30.
- Lohmann K, Reininger E, Bauer R: Screening of European anti-inflammatory herbal drugs for inhibition of cyclooxygenase-1 and -2. *Phytomedicine* 2000; Suppl. 2: 99.
- Longe JL (project editor). The Gale Encyclopedia of Alternative Medicine. 2nd Edition, Thomson Gale, 2005. Volume 1, pp. 526-7.
- Mattocks AR. Chemistry and toxicology of pyrrolizidine alkaloids. London, Academic Press, 1986. pp. 272-290.
- McLean EK. The toxic actions of pyrrolizidine (*Senecio*) alkaloids. *Pharmacological Review* 1970; 22: 429-83.
- Mei N, Guo L, Fu PP, Heflich RH, Chen T. Mutagenicity of comfrey (*Symphytum Officinale*) in rat liver. *British Journal of Cancer* 2005; 92: 873-5.
- Mei N, Guo L, Zhang L, Shi L, Sun YA, Fung C, Moland CL, Dial SL, Fuscoe JC, Chen T. Analysis of gene expression changes in relation to toxicity and tumorigenesis in the livers of Big Blue transgenic rats fed comfrey (*Symphytum officinale*). *BMC Bioinformatics*. 2006; 7: Suppl 2: S16.
- Mohabbat O, Youngos MS, Merzad AA, Srivastava RN, Sediz GG, Aram GN. An outbreak of hepatic veno-occlusive disease in north-western Afghanistan. *Lancet* 1976; 2: 269-71.
- Mohammad FV, Noorwlw M, Ahmad VU, Sener B. Bisdesmosidic Triterpenoidal Saponins from the Roots of *Symphytum officinale*. *Planta Med* 1995; 61: 94.
- OECD. 1997. OECD guideline for testing of chemicals. Bacterial reverse mutation test. OECD Test Guideline 471.
- PDR for Herbal Medicines*, 4th Edition. Thomson, 2000, pp. 212-4.
- Prakash AS, Pereira TN, Reilly PE, Seawright AA. Pyrrolizidine alkaloids in human diet. *Mutat. Res.* 1999; 15: (443) 53±67.
- Predel HG, Giannetti B, Koll R, Bulitta M, Staiger C. Efficacy of a Comfrey root extract ointment in comparison to a Diclofenac gel in the treatment of ankle distortions: Results of an observer-blind, randomized, multicenter study. *Phytomedicine* 2005; 12: 707-14.
- Rao MS, Reddy JK. Malignant neoplasms in rats fed lasiocarpine. *Br J Cancer* 1978; 37: 289-92.
- Ridker PM, Ohkuma S, McDermott WV, Trey C, Huxtable RJ. Hepatic venoocclusive disease associated with the consumption of pyrrolizidine-containing dietary supplements. *Gastroenterology*. 1985; 88: 1050-4.
- Ritschel WA, Starzacher A, Sabouni A, Hussain AS, Koch HP. Percutaneous absorption of rosmarinic acid in the rat. *Methods Find Exp Clin Pharmacol*. 1989; 11: 345-52.
- Rode D. Comfrey toxicity revisited. *TRENDS in Pharmacological Sciences* 2002; 23: 497-9.

- Roman GP, Neagu E, Moroeanu V, Radu GL. Concentration of *Symphytum officinale* extracts with cytostatic activity by tangential flow ultrafiltration. *Romanian Biotechnological Letters* 2008; 13: 4008-13.
- Schaefer C, Peters PWJ, Miller RK. *Drugs During Pregnancy and Lactation*. Academic Press, 2007. p. 772.
- Schmidtke-Schrezenmeier G, Reck R, Gerster G. Behandlung der nichtaktivierten Gonarthrose—Besserung durch ein Phytotherapeutikum. *Therapiewoche* 1992; 42: 1322–5.
- Sener B.: Recent results in the search for bioactive compounds from Turkish medicinal plants. *Pure and Applied Chemistry* 1994; 66: 2295-2298.
- Sperl W, Stuppner H, Gassner I, Judmaier W, Dietze O, Vogel W. Reversible hepatic veno - occlusive disease in an infant after consumption of pyrrolizidine-containing herbal tea. *Eur J Pediatr* 1995; 154: 112-16.
- Staiger C, Wegener T. Beinwell in der Therapie stumpfer Traumen: Anwendung bei Kindern. *Zeitschrift für Phytotherapie* 2008; 29: 58-64.
- Stamford IF, Tavares IA.: The effect of an aqueous extract of comfrey on prostaglandin synthesis by rat isolated stomach. *J Pharm Pharmacol*. 1983; 35: 816–7.
- Stickel F, Seitz HK. The efficacy and safety of comfrey. *Publ Health Nutrition* 2000; 3: 501-8.
- Tutin TG, Heywood VH, Burges NA, Moore DM, Valentine DH, Walters SM, Webb DA (ed.). *Flora Europaea*. University Press, Cambridge, 1992.
- Van den Dungen F, Beukelman CJ, Van den Berg AJJ, Quarles van Ufford HC, Van Dijk H, Labadie RP. High molecular weight complement inhibitors of *Symphytum officinale*. *Clin. Exp. Immunol*. 86 Suppl. 1 (1991), p. 3.
- Weston CFM, Cooper BT, Davies JD, Levine DF. Veno-occlusive disease of the liver secondary to digestion of comfrey. *British Medical Journal* 1987; 295: 183.
- Wexler P (editor). *Encyclopedia of Toxicology*. 2nd edition. Elsevier, 2005. pp. 585-7.
- White RD, Krumpnerman PH, Cheeke PR, Buhler DR.: An evaluation of acetone extracts from six plants in the Ames mutagenicity test *Toxicol Lett*. 1983; 15: 25-31.
- Yan CC, Cooper RA, Huxtable RJ. The comparative metabolism of the four pyrrolizidine alkaloids, seneciophylline, retrorsine, monocrotaline, and trichodesmine in the isolated, perfused rat liver. *Toxicol Appl Pharmacol* 1995; 133: 277-84.
- Yeong ML, Clark SP, Waring JM, Wilson RD, Wakefield SJ: The effects of comfrey derived pyrrolizidine alkaloids on rat liver. *Pathology*. 1991; 23: 35-8.
- Yeong ML, Swinburn B, Kennedy M, Nicholson G: Hepatic veno-occlusive disease associated with comfrey ingestion. *J Gastroenterol Hepatol*. 1990; 5: 211-4.
- Yeong ML, Wakefield SJ, Ford HC: Hepatocyte membrane injury and bleb formation following low dose comfrey toxicity in rats. *Int J Exp Pathol*. 1993; 74: 211-7.