



EUROPEAN MEDICINES AGENCY
SCIENCE MEDICINES HEALTH

10 February 2011
EMA/CHMP/SAWP/102001/2011
Procedure No.: EMEA/H/SAB/005/1/QA/2010
Committee for Medicinal Products for Human Use (CHMP)

Qualification Opinion of Alzheimer's Disease Novel Methodologies/biomarkers for BMS-708163

Agreed by Scientific Advice Working Party	January 2011
Adoption by CHMP for release for consultation	20 January 2011
Released for consultation	10 February 2011
End of consultation (deadline for comments)	25 March 2011

Comments should be provided using this [template](#). The completed comments form should be sent to Qualification@ema.europa.eu

Keywords	<i>Alzheimer's Disease (AD), CSF Biomarkers, prodromal AD (Dubois criteria)</i>
----------	---



1 Background

2 The European Medicines Agency qualification process is a new, voluntary, scientific pathway leading to
3 either a CHMP opinion or a Scientific Advice of novel methodologies on innovative methods or drug
4 development tools. It includes qualification of biomarkers developed by consortia, networks,
5 public/private partnerships, learned societies or pharmaceutical industry for a specific intended use in
6 pharmaceuticals R&D.

7 The Qualification team was: Prof. Cristina Sampaio (coordinator), Dr Armin Koch, Dr David Neil, Dr
8 Christine Gispén-de Wied, Prof Fernando de Andrés Trelles, Dr Bertil Jonsson. CHMP peer reviewer was
9 Prof. Luca Pani. The EMA Scientific Administrator was Dr Maria Isaac.

10 The present opinion addresses the question as to whether the use of two cerebral spinal fluid (CSF)
11 related biomarkers (A β 1-42 and total tau ¹) are qualified in selecting (*i.e.* to categorize) subjects for
12 trials in early Alzheimer's Disease (AD) as having a high probability of being in the prodromal stage of
13 the disease.

14 The vast majority of the data used in CHMP's evaluation have been submitted by the Company that
15 requested the qualification (BMS) and are all published literature available in the public domain. In a
16 few circumstances they have been supplemented by papers searched for by members of the
17 qualification team.

18 Given the extent of the literature in this field CHMP restricted the analysis to prospective longitudinal
19 studies that were set to evaluate the sensitivity and specificity of the mentioned CSF biomarkers in the
20 long term (>1 year).

21 There are some constraints in this exercise since the field has been dominated for many years by the
22 concept of minimal cognitive impairment (MCI), as defined by the Petersen Criteria, and only recently
23 the concept of prodromal AD as defined by the Dubois Criteria (2007) has arisen. The difference
24 between the Petersen Criteria and the core clinical Dubois Criteria is that the Dubois Criteria uses a
25 specific cognitive test for episodic memory impairment and therefore the population selected by the
26 core clinical Dubois Criteria is more specific than the MCI population defined by Petersen.

27 All the prospective longitudinal studies that informed the accuracy of CSF biomarkers were performed
28 in populations defined by the Petersen criteria and were therefore less specific than those populations
29 which will be enrolled in future trials.

30 From a meta-analysis of all prospective studies based on the population defined by the Petersen
31 Criteria, the sensitivity of the combination A β 1-42+total tau to predict AD type dementia was 0.87,
32 95% CI 0.80 -0.95, the specificity 0.70, 95% CI 0.57-0.83 and the positive predictive value of 0.65,
33 95% CI 0.53-0.77.

34 Based on these data and despite the fact that the populations were not defined with exactly the same
35 criteria we consider that CSF Biomarkers are Qualified for selecting patients in the context of clinical
36 trials.

37 The Company BMS requested Qualification of Novel Methodology namely amyloid biomarkers as related
38 to the application of the Dubois Criteria for prodromal AD.

39 Scope

40 The Dubois Criteria (2007) envisage a stepwise approach as follows:

41 "In the absence of completely specific biomarkers, the clinical diagnosis of AD can still be only
42 probabilistic, even in the case of typical AD. To meet criteria for probable AD, an affected individual
43 must fulfill criterion A (the core clinical criterion) and at least one or more of the supportive biomarker
44 criteria such as abnormal cerebrospinal fluid biomarker.

45 The Dubois Criteria (2007) bring the diagnosis of Alzheimer's disease to a stage of disease when

¹ There is a point for clarification about the use of the two biomarkers in study A β 1-42 and total tau. For all studies that have been analyzed the patients despite being in a relative early stage of the disease they were sufficiently advanced to have changes in both biomarkers thus they are connected by AND. However recent models suggest that there are a temporal succession for changes in these biomarkers and that in very early stages, before prodromal, Ab42 changes before than total tau, yet that temporal window is earlier than the one we are discussing here therefore the 2 biomarkers are connected by AND.

46 dementia is not yet present. It is important to note that these criteria rely centrally in the clinical
47 assessment and the biochemical and other markers are described as supportive.

48 Recently in a clarification paper the same group of authors elaborated the most appropriate
49 terminology Dubois et al. (2010) and on the role of the supportive markers. Accordingly, "Prodromal
50 AD (also called "pre-dementia stage of AD") refers to the early symptomatic, pre-dementia phase of
51 AD in which (1) clinical symptoms including episodic memory loss of the hippocampal type
52 (characterized by a free recall deficit on testing not normalized with cueing) are present, but not
53 sufficiently severe to affect instrumental activities of daily living and do not warrant a diagnosis of
54 dementia; and in which (2) biomarker evidence from CSF or imaging is supportive of the presence of
55 AD pathological changes. This phase is now included in the new definition of AD. The term of
56 prodromal AD might disappear in the future if AD is considered to encompass both the pre-dementia
57 and dementia stages.

58 As it can be understood from the explanation above to fulfill the Dubois Criteria the subject must meet
59 both the clinical and at least one of the supportive criteria.

60 Among the supportive criteria listed by Dubois et al., are the CSF biomarkers: low amyloid β 1-42
61 concentrations, increased tau concentrations, or increased p-tau concentrations or a combination of
62 these three. The use of these biomarkers was meant to increase the specificity of the diagnosis of AD
63 or, in practice, the use of these biomarkers as tools to increase the likelihood to correctly predict that a
64 given individual who is suffering from a specific amnesic disorder will evolve to develop a full blown
65 dementia status of the Alzheimer's type in a relative short time window of up to 2 years.

66 For the time being the use of these biomarkers is restricted to enrich cohorts and to allow the design of
67 more efficient clinical trials. Although this is not the remit of the current evaluation, there are already
68 discussions in the literature about the diagnostic value of such biomarker at the individual level
69 Forlenza et al. (2010).

70 BMS presented two types of amyloid related biomarkers in the context described above. In this
71 document we are set to evaluate the data on pathologic CSF Biomarkers (low CSF A β 1-42, high total-
72 tau [t-tau], phosphorylated tau [p-tau] and their combinations).

73 After analyzing all the data submitted and data in public domain, the CHMP thinks that the evidence
74 available is strong enough to issue an opinion regarding CSF biomarkers at this point in time.

75 **Scientific Discussion & Methodology**

76 The issue at stake in the decision to quality the CSF amyloid related biomarkers - low CSF A β 1-42,
77 high total-tau [t-tau], phosphorylated tau [p-tau] and their combinations - is to decide if there is
78 sufficiently good accuracy (sensitivity and specificity) to discriminate patients that are at risk of
79 developing AD, i.e. will the use of these biomarkers be sufficiently accurate to correctly predict that a
80 given individual who is suffering from a specific amnesic disorder will evolve to develop a full blown
81 dementia status of Alzheimer's type in a relative short time window of up to 2 years, and that the
82 methodology is sufficiently reliable to be generalizable.

83 It is recognized that the type and number of CSF amyloid related biomarkers are much larger than the
84 selection chosen here, Hampel et al. (2010). The CHMP, however recognizeS that these are the ones
85 for which the largest amount of accumulated data is available and therefore it is reasonable to start
86 with them.

87 The following table summarizes all longitudinal studies that evaluated the predictive value of at least
88 one of the CSF Biomarkers under consideration - (low CSF Amyloid β 1-42 [A β], high total-tau [T-tau],
89 phosphorylated tau [P-tau]) that have been published.

Study	Year	Location	Marker	Sample Size	Baseline Subjects	Follow Up (Yrs)	N ^o Convert	H.R. (95% CI)	Sensitivity	Specificity	AUC
Bouwman	2007	Netherlands	CSF-A β	59	MCI	18 mos.	30	5.0 (1.4 - 18.0)			
			Total- τ	59	MCI	18 mos.	30	5.3 (1.5, 19.2)			
			T- τ / A β	59	MCI	18 mos.	30	3.0 (1.7-7.9)			
Fagan	2007	US	CSF-A β	61	Cog Normal	3	13	0.99 (0.99 - 1.01)			
			Total- τ	61	Cog Normal	3	13	1.00 (1.00 - 1.01)			

			P- τ	61	Cog Normal	3	13	1.02 \square (0.99 - 1.04)			
			T- τ / A β	61	Cog Normal	3	13	5.21 \square (1.58 - 17.22)			
			P- τ / A β	61	Cog Normal	3	13	4.39 \square (1.62 - 11.86)			
Buchhave	2008	Sweden	CSF-A β	148	MCI	4	63	6.83 \square (2.40 - 19.4)			
Vemuri	2009	US	CSF-A β	186	aMCI	2	60	1.3 \square			
			T- τ	186	aMCI	2	60	1.7 \square (1.1 - 2.6)			
			P- τ	186	aMCI	2	60	1.8 \square (1.1 - 2.9)			
			T- τ / A β	186	aMCI	2	60	2.0 \square (1.1 - 3.4)			
Hansson	2006	Sweden	T- / A \otimes	137	MCI	4	57	17.7 \square (5.3 - 58.9)	95%	83%	
			P- / A \otimes	137	MCI	4	57	16.8 \square (5.0 - 56.5)	95%	81%	
			(T- A \otimes) / P- τ	137	MCI	4	57	19.8 \square (6.0 - 65.7)	95%	87%	
Hansson	2007	Sweden	A \otimes	137	MCI	4	57	8.97 \square (3.2-24.9)	93	53	0.77
Hansson	2009	Sweden	T- τ / A \otimes	167	MCI	4	69	13.4 \square (4.0 - 45.1)	95%	83%	
Visser	2009	Multi-centre EU	T- τ / A \otimes	100	aMCI	3	35	26.8 (Odds Rat) \square (1.6-456.4)			
Bloom	2009	Sweden	CSF-A \otimes	28	MCI	3	14		85%		
			Total- τ	28	MCI	3	14	7.0 (Rel Risk) \square (1.7 - 38.6)		86%	
			P- τ	28	MCI	3	14	3.5 (Rel Risk) \square (1.2 - 10.1)		83%	
			A \otimes , P- τ , and T- τ	28	MCI	3	14		64%	79%	
Mattsson	2009	12 EU Memory Clinics	CSF-A \otimes	750	MCI	2	271		79%	65%	0.78
			Total- τ	750	MCI	2	271		86%	56%	0.79
			P- τ	750	MCI	2	271		84%	47%	0.76
			T- τ / A \otimes	750	MCI	2	271	5.2 (Rel Risk) \square (3.9 - 6.9)	83%	72%	

90 Bouwman et al. (2007), presented a follow-up of 64 subjects diagnosed as MCI according to the
91 Petersen Criteria, using Elisa commercial kits to measure A β 1-42 and tau, with cut-off for A β 1-42 <
92 495 pg/mL and for tau > 356 pg/mL. They found an increased risk of progression to dementia of
93 about 3-fold.

94 Fagan et al. (2007), is a study focused on cognitively normal individuals thus less relevant for the
95 predicated here. Nevertheless, a sub analysis in this study correlated findings of Pittsburgh Compound
96 B (PIB) PET imaging with CSF biomarkers showing a good correlation that are relevant and interesting
97 for a later discussion of the PET markers. The conclusion of this study stated that the very mildest
98 symptomatic stage of AD exhibits the same CSF biomarker phenotype as more advanced AD. In
99 addition, levels of CSF A β 1-42, when combined with amyloid imaging, augment clinical methods for
100 identifying in individuals with brain amyloid deposits whether dementia is present or not. Importantly,
101 CSF tau/A β 1-42 ratios show strong promise as antecedent (nonclinical) biomarkers that predict future
102 dementia in cognitively normal older adults.

103 Buchhave et al. (2008), studied a population of MCI subjects defined by Petersen Criteria however the
104 interest of the authors was to combine different markers, cognitive tests, PET and CSF biomarkers;
105 therefore the data for the CSF marker alone is not presented by itself. A commercial kit was used to

106 measure A β 1-42 and the cut of was < 640ng/l. They concluded that combinations of the cube copying
107 test with MMSE, rCBF and CSF A β 1-42 measurements could help in identifying subgroups of MCI
108 subjects with either substantially reduced or increased risk for future development of AD.

109 In Vemuri et al. (2009), data from the Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging Initiative were used to study
110 cross-sectionally the correlations of both MRI and CSF biomarkers with clinical diagnosis and with
111 cognitive performance in cognitively normal (CN), amnesic mild cognitive impairment (aMCI), or AD
112 cohorts with both CSF and MRI. Baseline CSF (t-tau, A β 1-42, and p-tau181P) and MRI scans were
113 obtained in 399 subjects (109 CN, 192 aMCI, 98 AD). Structural Abnormality Index (STAND) scores,
114 which reflect the degree of AD-like features in MRI, were computed for each subject. A β 1-42 did not
115 have an ordered relationship of time to conversion by quartiles that were biologically sensible, which
116 might be due to the significant nonlinear relationship. The authors concluded that CSF and MRI
117 biomarkers independently contribute to intergroup diagnostic discrimination and the combination of
118 CSF and MRI provides better prediction than either source of data alone. However, according to their
119 results, MRI provides greater power and better correlation with general cognition and functional status
120 cross-sectionally than the CSF biomarker tested.

121 Hansson et al. (2006), assessed a series of 180 consecutive patients with MCI (Petersen Criteria), 137
122 of them underwent successful lumbar puncture at baseline. Patients at risk of developing dementia
123 were followed clinically for 4-6 years. Additionally, 39 healthy individuals, cognitively stable over 3
124 years, served as controls. The authors analysed CSF concentrations of A β 1-42, total tau (T-tau), and
125 phosphorylated tau (P-tau181) using Luminex xMAP technology. The cut-off values that best indicated
126 a relative risk of progression to incipient AD were T-tau > 350 ng/L and A β 1-42 < 530 ng/L, which
127 defined pathological (or Alzheimer's disease-indicative) CSF. The combination of T-tau and A β 1-42/P-
128 tau181 ratio yielded closely similar results (sensitivity 95%, specificity 87%, hazard ratio 19.8).

129 Hansson et al. (2007) is the same cohort as Hansson et al. (2006) but it provides further data on the
130 diagnostic accuracy concerning Alzheimer's dementia. The CSF A β 1-42 concentration identified
131 incipient AD in the MCI cohort with a sensitivity of 93% (95% CI, 82- 98) and a specificity of 53%
132 (95% CI, 41-64) when an optimal cut-off value of 0.64 ng/mL, as identified by the Youden method,
133 was used. The positive likelihood ratio was 2.0 and the negative likelihood ratio was 0.14 for A β 1-42.
134 The A β 1-42 / A β 1-40 ratio resulted in a sensitivity of 87% (95% CI, 76-95) and a specificity of 78%
135 (95% CI, 67-86) for prediction of AD among the MCI patients using the optimal cut-off value 0.95. The
136 positive likelihood ratio was 3.9 and the negative likelihood ratio was 0.16 for the A β 1-42 / A β 1-40
137 ratio. When comparing the diagnostic performance of these two approaches, the area under the curve
138 was larger for the A β 1-42 / A β 1-40 ratio (0.87; 95% CI, 0.80-0.92) than for AB42 alone (0.77; 95%
139 CI, 0.69-0.84), which was statistically significant (p < 0.05).

140 Hansson et al. (2009), is a study aimed to identify preclinical AD in patients with MCI using
141 measurements of both regional cerebral blood flow (rCBF) and cerebrospinal fluid (CSF) biomarkers.
142 Baseline rCBF assessments ((133)Xe method) were performed in 70 patients with MCI who were
143 cognitively stable for 4-6 years, 69 patients with MCI who subsequently developed AD, and 33 healthy
144 individuals. CSF was collected at baseline and analyzed for A β 1-42, total tau and phosphorylated tau.
145 In contrast to patients with stable MCI, those who subsequently developed AD had decreased rCBF in
146 the temporo-parietal cortex already at baseline. The relative risk of future progression to AD was
147 particularly increased in MCI patients with decreased rCBF in parietal cortex (hazard ratio 3.1,
148 P<0.0001). Subjects with pathological levels of both CSF tau and A β 1-42 were also at high risk of
149 developing AD (hazard ratio 13.4, P<0.0001). The MCI patients with a combination of decreased
150 parietal rCBF and pathological CSF biomarkers at baseline had a substantially increased risk of future
151 development of AD, with a hazard ratio of 24.3 (P<0.0001), when compared to those with normal CSF
152 biomarkers. Moreover, decreased parietal rCBF (but not CSF biomarkers) was associated with a more
153 rapid progression to AD. The authors concluded that the combination of rCBF and CSF biomarkers
154 improves the risk assessment of progression to AD in patients with MCI.

155 Visser et al. (2009), for the DESCRIPA study, investigated the prevalence of a CSF AD profile in
156 patients with subjective cognitive impairment (SCI), non-amnesic mild cognitive impairment (naMCI)
157 or aMCI and the association of this profile with cognitive outcome in each group. Patients with SCI,
158 naMCI, aMCI, and neurologically healthy controls were recruited from 20 memory clinics across Europe,
159 between January 2003 and June, 2005, into this prospective cohort study. A CSF AD profile was
160 defined as an abnormal ratio of A β 1-42/tau. Patients were assessed annually up to 3 years. Outcomes
161 measures were changes in memory, overall cognition, mini-mental state examination (MMSE) score,
162 daily function, and progression to AD-type dementia.

163 The CSF AD profile was defined as a score below 1, calculated with the formula $A\beta 1-42 / (240 + [1 \cdot 18 \times T-$
164 $\text{tau}])$. This formula can distinguish patients with AD from controls or from patients with other types of

165 dementia and can identify patients with potential AD-type dementia among patients with MCI at a
166 sensitivity in the range of 88–91% and a specificity in the range of 52–90%.

167 All patients who were diagnosed with AD-type dementia at follow-up had CSF AD profile at baseline. A
168 CSF AD profile in patients with a MCI was associated with an increased risk for AD type-dementia
169 (Odds ratio OR, 26.8% 95% CI 1.6-456.4; $p=0.02$).

170 Bloom et al. (2009), using ELISA, measured the CSF biomarkers in 47 AD patients, 58 patients with
171 MCI (Petersen Criteria) and 35 healthy control subjects. Twenty-eight MCI patients revisited the clinic
172 and half of them progressed to AD during a period of 3–12 years. Results corroborate an increased risk
173 for progression from MCI to AD with elevated CSF T-tau and P-tau and with the presence of the APOE
174 E4/E4 genotype, but not with decreased A β 1-42. This paper demonstrated that MCI subjects with high
175 CSF T-tau or P-tau and APOE E4 homozygosity progressed faster from MCI to AD. Therefore these
176 biomarkers can be considered robust predictors of AD and associated with a more rapid progression
177 from MCI to AD.

178 Mattsson et al. (2009), investigated the diagnostic accuracy of CSF A β 1-42, total tau protein (T-tau),
179 and tau phosphorylated at position threonine 181 (P-tau) for predicting incipient AD in patients with
180 MCI. This study had 2 parts: a cross-sectional study involving patients with AD and controls to identify
181 cut points, followed by a prospective cohort study involving patients with MCI, conducted 1990-2007.
182 A total of 750 individuals with MCI, 529 with AD, and 304 controls were recruited by 12 centers in
183 Europe and the United States. Individuals with MCI were followed up for at least 2 years or until
184 symptoms had progressed to clinical dementia. Main outcome measures were sensitivity, specificity,
185 positive and negative likelihood ratios (LRs) of CSF A β 1-42, T-tau, and P-tau for identifying incipient
186 AD.

187 Of the patients with MCI, 420 did not progress to dementia (stable MCI) when followed up for at least
188 2 years (median, 3; range, 2-11 years). During follow-up, 330 cases with MCI showed progression of
189 cognitive symptoms to clinical dementia. Of these, 271 were diagnosed as having AD (i.e., had
190 incipient AD at base- line), and 59 with other types of dementia, including 28 with vascular de-mentia,
191 14 with dementia with Lewy bodies, 7 with fronto temporal dementia, and 10 with neurological
192 diseases and dementia. In the MCI sample, the annual rate of AD diagnosis was around 11% in the
193 first 4 study years. The median time to conversion was 24 months (range, 2-126 months) in AD, 30
194 months in vascular dementia (range, 6-77 months), 12 months in dementia with Lewy bodies (range,
195 7-52 months), 22 months in fronto temporal dementia (range, 6-37 months), and 36 months in other
196 dementias (range 24-60 months).

197 Following recommendations in the Standard for Reporting Diagnostic Criteria, Bossuytt et al., (2003)
198 cutoff levels for individual biomarkers were established for all AD patients vs. all controls, with
199 sensitivity for the index test set at 85%. Positive CSF T-tau and P-tau test results were defined as
200 values above the cutoff (T-tau>320 ng/L and P-tau> 52 ng/L, respectively), and positive CSF A β 1-42
201 as values below the cutoff (<482 ng/L).

202 A β 1-42 had a sensitivity of 79% (215 of 271; 95% CI, 74%-84%), a specificity of 65% (321 of 479;
203 95% CI, 61%-69%), a positive Likelihood Ratio (LR) of 2.3 (95% CI, 2.0-2.6), and a negative LR of
204 0.32 (95% CI, 0.28-0.36). P-tau had a sensitivity of 84% (227 of 270; 95% CI, 80%-88%), a
205 specificity of 47% (225 of 479; 95% CI, 42%-52%), a positive LR of 1.6 (95% CI, 1.4-1.8), and a
206 negative LR of 0.34 (95% CI, 0.31-0.37). T- tau had a sensitivity of 86% (232 of 271; 95% CI, 82%-
207 90%), a specificity of 56% (268 of 479, 95% CI, 51%-61%), a positive LR of 1.9 (95% CI, 1.7-2.2),
208 and a negative LR of 0.26 (95% CI, 0.23- 0.29). The area under the receiver operating characteristic
209 curve was 0.78 (95% CI, 0.75-0.82) for A β 42; 0.76 (95% CI, 0.72-0.80) for P-tau; and 0.79 (95% CI,
210 0.76-0.83) for T-tau.

211 The final index test was an equation for the combination of A β 1-42/P-tau ratio (y) and T-tau (x), with
212 cutoffs constructed in the training set of all patients with AD vs. all controls, and sensitivity for AD set
213 at greater than 85% based on logistic regression analysis ($y = 3.694+0.0105x$). This equation was
214 evaluated in MCI patients with incipient AD vs. controls in a first step and in MCI patients only in a final
215 step. As shown in earlier studies, the predictive value of the biomarkers combined was greater than
216 the predictive value of any individual biomarker. In comparing patients with MCI and incipient AD with
217 controls, the cutoff equation achieved a sensitivity of 83% (223 of 270, 95% CI, 78%- 88%), a
218 specificity of 88% (266 of 303, 95% CI, 84%-92%), a positive LR of 7.0 (95% CI, 5.7-8.5), and a
219 negative LR of 0.17 (95% CI 0.14-0.21). When applied to all MCI patients only, the specificity was
220 72% (345/479, 95% CI, 68%-76%), the positive LR was 3.0 (95% CI, 2.5-3.4), the negative LR was
221 0.24 (95% CI, 0.21-0.28), the positive predictive value was 62%, and the negative predictive value
222 was 88%. The relative risk for incipient AD in MCI patients with a positive result on this equation was
223 5.2 (95% CI, 3.9-6.9).

224 In addition to the studies in the table that are the ones discussed by the Company there is a further
225 analysis of the ADNI data, Shaw et al. (2009). The ADNI is a large, multicenter, longitudinal
226 neuroimaging study, launched in 2004 by the National Institute on Aging, the National Institute of
227 Biomedical Imaging and Bioengineering, the Food and Drug Administration, private pharmaceutical
228 companies, and nonprofit organizations. ADNI includes 819 adult subjects, 55 to 90 years old, who
229 meet entry criteria for a clinical diagnosis of amnesic MCI (n = 397), probable AD (n = 193), or
230 normal cognition (n = 229). Baseline CSF samples were obtained in the morning after an overnight
231 fast from 416 ADNI subjects (AD = 102, MCI = 200, NC = 114 with average [\pm standard deviation]
232 ages of 75 ± 8 , 75 ± 7 , and 76 ± 5 years, respectively; Premortem CSF was obtained from separate,
233 ADNI-independent groups of autopsy-confirmed AD cases and additional NC subjects who were
234 matched for age to provide a pathological basis for these biomarker measurements. The CSF t-tau, p-
235 tau181p, and A β 1-42 concentrations of these individuals were measured using the same reagents and
236 assay system described earlier for the baseline CSF samples from ADNI subjects.

237 As expected, there were ADNI MCI subjects who converted to a clinical diagnosis of probable AD during
238 the first year of follow-up. As of August 15, 2008, there were a total of 37 MCI subjects who had
239 provided CSF samples at baseline when they entered ADNI and who 12 months thereafter were
240 documented to be converters to AD at the time of their year 1 visit. The average biomarker
241 concentrations and ratio values for these MCI to AD converters were different ($p < 0.0001$) from the
242 corresponding results for the ADNI NC group, and as noted later, they had an AD-like CSF profile
243 incidence comparable with that seen in the ADNI AD group. On the other hand, the three MCI subjects
244 who back-converted to NC status showed an NC-like CSF tau and A β profile at baseline. The CSF t-tau
245 values for these MCI subjects were 69, 73, and 83pg/mL, all less than the cutoff value of 93pg/mL; the
246 values for A β 1-42 were 253, 233, and 285pg/mL, all greater than the cutoff value of 192pg/mL; and
247 the values for p-tau181p were 21, 25, and 20 pg/mL, two less than the cutoff value of 23pg/mL and
248 one slightly more than it. The change in clinical diagnosis for these three MCI individuals was based on
249 an improvement on several cognitive measures including the ADAS-Cog, Mini-Mental State
250 Examination, and memory measures.

251 Finally, application of the cut points for the three best pathologically based parameters, A β 1-42, t-
252 tau/A β 1-42, and the LRTAA logistic regression model, for the presence of an AD-like CSF profile in the
253 ADNI AD, MCI, and NC groups, as well as in the MCI subjects who converted to AD, showed the
254 following incidence of an AD-like CSF profile: 91, 88, and 89%, respectively, for AD; 74, 69, and 70%,
255 respectively, for MCI; 38, 34, and 31%, respectively, for NC; and 86.5, 89, and 86.5%, respectively,
256 for MCI converters to AD.

257 **Conclusions**

258 The prospective data available is very consistent in showing that subjects diagnosed as MCI according
259 to the Petersen Criteria which are less specific for AD than the clinical core of the Dubois Criteria that
260 have a positive CSF biomarker profile based on A β 1-42 and Tau are more likely to develop dementia in
261 the coming 2 to 3 years. How likely that evolution for dementia is, is still relative uncertain but it is
262 much more frequent than when the CSF biomarker profile is negative. All studies are supportive of the
263 concept that a positive signature predicts the evolution to dementia since they have found that the CSF
264 biomarker signature based on A β 1-42 and tau predicts the evolution to dementia in cohorts of MCI
265 patients diagnosed according with the Petersen criteria. There are 2 exceptions, one being the study by
266 Vemuri et al. in a subset of the ADNI data the multi factorial model did not find that the CSF signature
267 would add any information to the MRI and the other is by Bloom et al. 2009 in a small sample size
268 study could only find a value for the increased Tau but not for the low A β 1-42.

269 Given the consistency of the data available CHMP concludes that a positive signature of CSF
270 biomarkers, i.e. a low A β 1-42 and high tau is qualified to predict predictive for an evolution for
271 dementia in patients diagnosed as MCI.

272 To establish the accuracy of the predictive value of the Biomarkers signature CHMP took advantage of
273 a published systematic review and meta-analysis. While in the discussion above only studies with more
274 than 1.5 years of follow-up were retrieved by the Company in the meta-analysis quoted here, van
275 Rossum IA et al. (2010) all longitudinal studies were considered.

276 The mean conversion rate to AD-type dementia in the studies was 37% during a mean follow-up of 2.5
277 years. Cohen's delta show that A β 1-42, T-tau, p-tau were significant predictors of outcome. The
278 highest OR for AD type dementia was found for the combination of A β 1-42 and T tau with or without p-
279 tau (OR 18.1, 95% CI, 9.6-34.2). An abnormal combination was defined as an abnormal ratio of these
280 markers or as an abnormal score for at least 2 of these markers; the combination of A β 1-42 with only
281 p-tau and a slightly lower OR 17.5 (95% CI, 10-30.6). For the individual markers, the OR ranged from

282 7.54 (Aβ42) to 8.05 (p-tau). For further analysis the combination Aβ1-42 and T-tau was selected
283 because it was studied in 8 studies with a total of 1236 MCI patients of which 454 converted to AD
284 type dementia. The sensitivity of this combination to predict AD type dementia was 0.87, 95% CI, 0.80
285 -0.95, the specificity 0.70, 95% CI, 0.57-0.83 and the positive predictive value of 0.65, 95% CI, 0.53-
286 0.77.

287 Given the values detailed above CHMP considered the positive signature of CSF biomarkers, i.e. a low
288 Aβ1-42 and high Tau qualified to predict the evolution to dementia in patients diagnosed as MCI. The
289 sensitivity will be at least 80% and the specificity 60%.

290 Overall the accuracy is considered to be sufficient to provide the desirable population enrichment of
291 patients at risk to develop AD dementia. In fact the biomarker signature of low Aβ1-42 and high Tau
292 has a relative high sensitivity what allows the exclusion of subjects with a low likelihood of developing
293 dementia when it is not present. The specificity is not as high, thus the signature is less useful in
294 predicting accurately the development of dementia. However for an individual diagnosed as MCI for
295 whom the CSF status is unknown the probability to convert to dementia is about 15% per year. This
296 rate increases about 3-fold if the CSF biomarkers are positive. In any case given that the signature has
297 a higher sensitivity than specificity its usefulness is greater for trial enrichment.

298 During the discussions, the SAWP touched upon the issues of reliability of the measurement methods.
299 This topic was not meant to be addressed in depth, thus limitation and impact on the qualification
300 decision are acknowledged (Berjeke et al. (2010), Mattsson et al. (2010), Teunissen et al. (2010)).

301 **CHMP Qualification opinion**

302 In patients with MCI a positive CSF biomarker signature based on a low Aβ1-42 and a high T-tau is
303 predictive of evolution to AD-dementia type. The PPV is at least 60%. Given the relative high
304 sensitivity and moderate specificity the CSF biomarker signature based on a low Aβ1-42 and a high T-
305 tau is mostly useful for enrichment of clinical trial populations.

306 ELISA methods to measure this CSF biomarkers signature are commercially available but the process
307 of measurement is also complex. It implies the standardization of all steps from liquor collection and
308 the type of vials where it is sampled to the last working procedure in the circuit in order to obtain
309 reliable results. International guidelines have been produced to assure inter-site concordance. These
310 guidelines must be enforced.

311 The CSF biomarker signature based on a low Aβ1-42 and a high-tau qualifies to identify MCI patients
312 as close as possible to the prodromal stage of AD, Dubois (2007) who are at risk to evolve into AD-
313 dementia. Collection, procedures and measurements of all CSF samples should be done in accordance
314 with Good Laboratory Practices and the specific International standards for these measurements.

315 **REFERENCES**

- 316 1. Berjeke et al. (2010), Confounding Factors Influencing Amyloid Beta Concentration in
317 Cerebrospinal Fluid. *Int J Alzheimers Dis.* 2010: 986310
- 318 2. Bloom ES, Giedraitis V, Zetterberg H, et al. Rapid progression from mild cognitive impairment to
319 Alzheimer's disease in subjects with elevated levels of tau in cerebrospinal fluid and the APOE
320 epsilon4/epsilon4 genotype. *Dement Geriatr Cogn Disord.* 2009; 27(5):458-64.
- 321 3. Bouwman, FH, Schoonenboom SN, van der Flier WM, et al. CSF biomarkers and medial temporal
322 lobe atrophy predict dementia in mild cognitive impairment. *Neurobiol Aging.* 2007, 28(7):1070-
323 4.
- 324 4. Buchhave P, Stomrud E, Warkentin S, et al. Cube copying test in combination with rCBF or CSF A
325 beta 42 predicts development of Alzheimer's disease. *Dement Geriatr Cogn Disord.* 2008;
326 25(6):544-52.
- 327 5. Dubois B, Feldman HH, Jacova C, et al. Research criteria for the diagnosis of Alzheimer's disease:
328 revising the NINCDS-ADRDA criteria. *Lancet Neurol.* 2007 Aug; 6(8):734-46.
- 329 6. Fagan AM, Roe CM, Xiong C, et al. Cerebrospinal Fluid tau/beta-Amyloid42 Ratio as a Prediction
330 of Cognitive Decline in Nondemented Older Adults. *Arch Neurol.* 2007; 64:343-49.
- 331 7. Forlenza et al. Diagnosis and biomarkers of predementia in Alzheimer's disease. *BMC Medicine*
332 2010, 8:89
- 333 8. Hansson O, Buchhave P, Zetterberg H, et al. Combined rCBF and CSF biomarkers predict
334 progression from mild cognitive impairment to Alzheimer's disease. *Neurobiol Aging* 2009;
335 30(2):165-73.
- 336 9. Hansson O, Zetterberg H, Buchhave P, et al. Association between CSF biomarkers and incipient
337 Alzheimer's disease in patients with mild cognitive impairment: a follow-up study. *Lancet Neurol.*
338 2006; 5(3):228-34.
- 339 10. Hansson O, Zetterberg H, Buchhave P, et al. Prediction of Alzheimer's disease using the CSF
340 Abeta42/Abeta40 ratio in patients with mild cognitive impairment. *Dement Geriatr Cogn Disord.*
341 2007; 23(5):316-20.
- 342 11. Hampel et al. Biomarkers for Alzheimer's disease: academic, industry and regulatory
343 perspectives. *Nat Drug Disc* 2010; 9: 560-574
- 344 12. Mattsson et al. (2010). Inter-laboratory variation in cerebrospinal fluid biomarkers for Alzheimer's
345 disease: united we stand, divided we fall. *Clinical Chemistry and Laboratory Medicine.* Volume 48,
346 Issue 5, Pages 603-607
- 347 13. Mattsson N, Zetterberg H, Hansson O, et al. CSF biomarkers and incipient Alzheimer disease in
348 patients with mild cognitive impairment. *JAMA* 2009; 302(4):385-93.
- 349 14. Petersen RC, Parisi JE, Dickson DW, et al., Neuropathologic features of amnesic mild cognitive
350 impairment. *Arch Neuro* 2006; 63:665-72.
- 351 15. Shaw LM, Vanderstichele H, Knapik-Czajka M, Clark CM, Aisen PS, Petersen RC, Blennow K,
352 Soares H, Simon A, Lewczuk P, Dean R, Siemers E, Potter W, Lee VM, Trojanowski JQ,
353 Alzheimer's Disease Neuroimaging Initiative. Cerebrospinal fluid biomarker signature in
354 Alzheimer's disease neuroimaging initiative subjects. *Ann Neurol.* 2009 Apr; 65(4):403-13.
- 355 16. Standard for Reporting Diagnostic Criteria (STARD criteria, Bossuytt et al., *BMJ* (2003) 326;
356 7379, 41-44)
- 357 17. Teunissen et al. (2010), Standardization of Assay Procedures for Analysis of the CSF Biomarkers
358 Amyloid β (1-42), Tau, and Phosphorylated Tau in Alzheimer's Disease: Report of an International
359 Workshop *Int J Alzheimers Dis.* pii: 635053
- 360 18. van Rossum IA, Vos S, Handels R, Pieter, Visser J. Biomarkers as Predictors for Conversion from
361 Mild Cognitive Impairment to Alzheimer-Type Dementia: Implications for Trial Design. *Journal of*
362 *Alzheimer's Disease* 2010, 20; 881-891.
- 363 19. Vemuri P, Wiste HJ, Weigand SD, et al. MRI and CSF biomarkers in normal, MCI, and AD
364 subjects: predicting future clinical change. *Neurology* 2009; 73(4):294-301.

- 365 20. Visser PJ, Verhey F, Knol DL, et al. Prevalence and prognostic value of CSF markers of
366 Alzheimer's disease pathology in patients with subjective cognitive impairment or mild cognitive
367 impairment in the DESCRIPA study: a prospective cohort study. *Lancet Neurol.* 2009; 8(7): 619-
368 27.